

## **FALL 2010 PHILOSOPHY G9509 • METAPHYSICS: ONTOLOGY OF THE ARTS**

---

Lydia Goehr – 710 Philosophy Hall, tel. 4-3665, email: lg131

Achille Varzi – 713 Philosophy Hall, tel. 4-3531, email: av72

Call Number	67347
Day & Time	M 4:10pm-6:00pm
Location	To be announced
Points	3
Approvals Required	None
Type	Seminar
Website	<a href="https://courseworks.columbia.edu">https://courseworks.columbia.edu</a>

### ► **Topics**

What is Art? What sort of thing is a Work of Art—a physical object, an event, ideal kind, imaginary entity, platonic form, type? Is there just one kind of WoA or are there substantive ontological differences between, say, paintings, sculptures, and musical works? How is art bounded by time and space? What would a geography of art look like? Do aesthetic or artistic differences make an ontological difference? How are WoAs related to the mental states and/or intentions of artists, critics, audiences? What role does interpretation and description play in determining the meaning or essence of art? What criteria of identity and individuation are relevant to WoAs? Under what conditions do WoAs come into existence, survive, or cease to exist? How do history and convention affect their ontology? What are hybrid arts or mixed-media artworks?

### ► **Readings**

The readings, primary and supplemental, are drawn from classic and contemporary literature of the analytic tradition and with a special emphasis on music. All readings are available in electronic form through *CourseWorks*, section *Class Files*, folder *Shared Files*. Required readings should always be read in advance, according to the schedule below. (Unnumbered readings, marked by an asterisk, are supplemental.)

### ► **Requirements**

Reading is essential; discussion is expected and will determine a significant part of the grade. For E-credit (letter grade) students, one final essay is due in the last week of classes (15-20 pp.). Topics should be approved in advance and ideally by mid-term. R-credit students are required to attend all classes and participate in a lively manner.

## 9/13, WEEK 1 – INTRODUCTION

---

## 9/20, WEEK 2 – DEFINITION

---

1. Ziff, P., 'The Task of Defining a Work of Art', *The Philosophical Review*, 62 (1953), pp. 58-78.
2. Kennick, W. E., 'Does Traditional Aesthetics Rest on a Mistake?', *Mind* 67 (1958), pp. 317-334.
3. Walton, K., 'Categories of Art', *Philosophical Review*, 79 (1970), pp. 334-367.
4. Diffey, T. J., 'Essentialism and the Definition of 'Art'', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 13 (1973), 103-120.

## 9/27, WEEK 3 – CONVENTION

---

1. Goodman, N., 'When Is Art?', in D. Perkins and B. Leondar (eds.), *The Arts and Cognition*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1977, pp. 11-19.
  2. Goodman, N., 'On StarMaking', *Synthese*, 45 (1980), pp. 210-215.
  3. Searle, J. R., *The Construction of Social Reality*, New York: Free Press, 1995 (esp. Chapter 2, 'Creating Institutional Facts', pp. 31-58).
- \* Schwartz, S. P., 'Natural Kinds and Nominal Kinds', *Mind*, 89 (1980), pp. 182-195.
  - \* Heller, M., *The Ontology of Physical Objects: Four-Dimensional Hunks of Matter*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990 (esp. Chapter 2, 'Conventional Objects', pp. 30-67).

## 10/4, WEEK 4 – CONCEPT

---

1. Gallie, W.B., 'Art as an Essentially Contested Concept', *The Philosophical Quarterly*, 6 (1956), pp. 97-114.
2. Gallie, W.B., 'Essentially Contested Concepts', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 56 (1955-1956), pp. 167-198
3. Goehr, L., *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992/2007 (Chap. 4, pp. 89-119 on "open concepts").
4. Gaut, B., "'Art' as a Cluster Concept", in N. Carroll (ed.), *Theories of Art Today*, Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2000, pp. 25-44.

## 10/11, WEEK 5 – INSTITUTION AND ARTWORLD

---

1. Danto, A.C., 'The Artworld', *The Journal of Philosophy*, 61 (1964), pp. 571-584.
  2. Dickie, G., *The Art Circle: A Theory of Art*, New York: Haven Publications, 1984 (sections to be specified)
  3. Zemach, E., 'No Identification Without Evaluation', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 26 (1986), pp. 239-251.
- \* Carroll, N., 'Identifying Art', in R. J. Yanal (ed.), *Institutions of Art*, University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994, pp. 3-39.
  - \* Yanal, R. J., 'The Institutional Theory of Art', in M. Kelly (ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Aesthetics*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1998, pp. 508-512.

## **10/18, WEEK 6 – DESCRIPTION**

---

1. Anscombe, G.E.M., 'Under a Description', *Noûs*, 13 (1979), pp. 219-233
2. Danto, A.C., 'Depiction and Description', *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 43 (1982), pp. 1-19.
3. Kania, A., 'The Methodology of Musical Ontology: Descriptivism and Its Implications', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 48 (2008), pp. 426-244

## **10/25, WEEK 7 – UNITY**

---

1. Wollheim, R., 'Are the Criteria of Identity that Hold for a Work of Art in the Different Arts Aesthetically Relevant?', *Ratio*, 20 (1978), pp. 29-48.
  2. Goodman, N., 'Comments on Wollheim's Paper', *Ratio*, 20 (1978), pp. 49-51.
  3. Wiggins, D., 'Comments on Wollheim's Paper', *Ratio*, 20 (1978), pp. 52-68.
- \* Casati, R., 'The Unity of the Kind Artwork', *Rivista di Estetica*, 23 (2003), pp. 3-31.

## **11/1, SPRING BREAK**

## **11/8, WEEK 8 – PLATONISM**

---

1. Wolterstorff, N., 'Toward An Ontology of Artworks', *Noûs*, 9 (1975), pp. 115-142.
  2. Levinson, J., 'What a Musical Work Is', *The Journal of Philosophy*, 77 (1980), pp. 5-28
  3. Kivy, P., 'Platonism in Music: A Kind of Defense', *Grazer Philosophische Studien*, 19 (1983), pp. 109–129.
- \* Goehr, L., *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992 (esp. Chapter 1, 'A Nominalist Theory of Musical Works', and Chapter 2, 'A Platonist Theory of Musical Works', pp. 13-68).
- \* Caplan, B. and Matheson, C., 'Can a Musical Work Be Created?', *British Journal of Aesthetics*. 44 (2004), pp. 113-134.

## **11/15, WEEK 9 – PLATONISM (2): TYPES AND TOKENS**

---

1. Wollheim, R., *Art and its Objects*, 2nd ed., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1980 (esp. Sections 35-36, pp. 74-80).
  2. Sharpe, R. A., 'Type, Token, Interpretation and Performance', *Mind*, 88 (1979), pp. 437-440.
  3. Dipert, R. R., 'Types and Tokens: A Reply to Sharpe', *Mind*, 89 (1980), pp. 587-588.
- \* Dodd, J., 'Musical Works as Eternal Types', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 40 (2000), pp. 424-440.
- \* Howell, R., 'Types, Indicated and Initiated', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 42 (2002), pp. 105-127.

## **11/22, WEEK 10 – NOMINALISM**

---

1. Goodman, N., *Languages of Art* (2nd ed.), Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1976 (esp. Chapter 1, 'Reality Remade', pp. 3-43, Chapter 2, 'The Sound of Pictures', pp. 45-95).

- \* Cameron, R., 'There Are No Things that Are Musical Works', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 48 (2008), pp. 295–314.

---

### **11/29, WEEK 11 – NOMINALISM (2): IDENTITY AND INDETERMINACY**

---

1. Goodman, N., *Languages of Art* (2nd ed.), Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1976 (Chapter 3, 'Art and Authenticity', pp. 99-123)
  2. Tormey, A., 'Indeterminacy and Identity in Art', *The Monist*, 58 (1974), pp. 203-215.
  3. Ziff, P., 'The Cow on the Roof', *The Journal of Philosophy*, 70 (1973), pp. 713-723
- \* Goodman, N., 'A Note on Copies', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 44 (1986), pp. 291–292.
- \* Predelli, S., 'Goodman and the Wrong Note Paradox', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 39 (1999), pp. 364-75.

---

### **12/6, WEEK 12 – ART, ARTIFACT, MATTER**

---

1. Margolis, J., 'Works of Art as Physically Embodied and Culturally Emergent Entities', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 14 (1974), pp. 187-196.
  2. Hilpinen, R., 'Artifacts and Works of Art', *Theoria*, 58 (1992), pp. 58-82.
  3. Dipert, R.R., *Artifacts, Art Works, and Agency*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1993 (esp. Chapter 9, 'Art Works as Artifacts', pp. 158-175).
  4. Thomson, J.J., 'The Statue and the Clay', *Noûs*, 32 (1998), pp. 149-173.
- \* Johnston, M., 'Constitution is Not Identity', *Mind* 101 (1992), pp. 89–105.
- \* Noonan, H.W., 'Constitution Is Identity', *Mind*, 102 (1993), pp. 133-146.
- \* Kornblith, H., 'Referring to Artifacts', *The Philosophical Review* 79 (1980), pp. 109-114.

---

### **12/13, WEEK 13 – VARIATION AND IMPROVISATION**

---

1. Alperson, P., 'On Musical Improvisation' *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 43 (1984), pp. 17-29.
2. Levinson, J., 'Hybrid Art Forms', *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 18 (1984), pp. 5-13.
3. Brown, L., 'Musical Works, Improvisation, and the Principle of Continuity', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 54 (1996), pp. 353-369.
4. Kania, A., 'Making Tracks: The Ontology of Rock Music', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, 64 (2006), pp. 401-414.